FY24 Operating Budget

MBTA Board of Directors
May 25, 2023
Recap of Five-Year Budget Gap Projections from Pro Forma Presentation (November 2022)

Excluding all FTA directive spending and one-time revenues

- **Excluding** the FTA directive response and one-time revenues, annual operating expenses would exceed operating revenues in all fare revenue scenario ranges for the next five years.
- FY24-FY25 baseline budget gaps shown planned to be resolved with one-time revenues.

FY24-FY28 projections carry greater uncertainty, planned updates to be provided at least annually.
Recap of FY24 – FY28 Budget Projections from Pro Forma Presentation

Including Initial (June) FTA directive spending and one-time revenues

• One-time reserve revenues are projected to resolve the budget gap in FY24 and FY25 under higher fare revenue scenarios
• Actual budget gaps depend on fare revenue and actual spending over the next two years
New Investments & Improvements

- **Major investment in safety and training 4x prior year efforts**
  - More than half of all new spending directly related to safety and training
  - Headcount investment for safety and training more than four times three-year average

- **Governor’s initiatives support MBTA priorities and needs**
  - $181M new one-time capital investments like bridge rehabilitation, station and accessibility improvements, and red-blue connector project
  - $20M to assist the MBTA in its training, recruitment and retention efforts.
  - $5M new one-time funding for the feasibility of implementing a means-tested fare program to expand affordability

- **New Chief Safety Officer for MassDOT & MBTA as shared service and primary representative for overall safety issues relating to transportation**
FY24 Operating Budget Summary

• Seeking Board vote to approve the FY24 budget and maintain Deficiency Fund transfer policy to plan for next year
• Fare revenue and ridership growth assumptions consistent with Board approved direction and preliminary budget vote
• New budgeted positions consistent with Board approved direction on safety and service expansions and preliminary budget vote
FY24 Programmatic Investments

- Investments in multiple priority initiatives for safety and service add to the operating budgeted headcount

- Adding new positions allows the MBTA to continue to aggressively post, recruit, and hire new positions to meet safety and service goals

- Given current labor market challenges, adding new positions will also likely maintain or increase the number of budgeted vacancies in the short-term, despite enhanced HR efforts

- Consistent with Board direction during Budget Preview Presentation in March 2023 and Preliminary Budget Presentation in April 2023

FTA directive response

- Response to August 2022 FTA report issuing special directives and individual action items on areas including right of way safety, rail yard train movements, Operations Control Center, safety certifications, workforce capacity, mitigating safety risks, safety promotion, and quality control/assurance – 455 new positions

Safety & Training beyond FTA directive scope

- Further investments in safety and training beyond the scope of the FTA’s safety management inspection (SMI), including bus transportation, preventative and corrective maintenance at facilities and stations, and enhanced capacity to train and hire new staff – 189 new positions

Bus Network Redesign

- Adding 126 new positions to continue the goal of phasing in a 25% increase in service over several years across the network to prioritize equity and add more frequent service (subject to bus operator shortages and hiring)

Green Line Extension

- Adding 54 new positions to fully operate and maintain the expanded light rail service, which opened for full service in December 2022

Means-tested Fares

- Low-Income Fares expands fare affordability across modes, addressing an existing gap for the low-income population ages 26-64, supported through the Governor’s budget recommendation of $5M in one-time start-up costs
FTA Safety Directive Response

Track Maintenance & PPE: $13.5M
- Addressing right of way safety, track repair, and consistent PPE requirements (Directive 22-04) – 97 positions

Vehicle Securement: $13.7M
Programmatic Investment/Increase Position Detail

FY24 Programmatic Initiative Increases

- All Other Changes, 140, 14%
- Bus Network Redesign, 126, 13%
- GLX, 54, 6%
- Safety & Training, 189, 20%
- FTA Directive Response, 455, 47%

FY24 Output & Department Mission Increases

- 964 new operating positions added to the FY24 budget above last year, including 644 positions (67%) for safety, training, & FTA directive response

- Service Delivery Support, 185
- System Maintenance & Security, 202

Service & Transportation, 577
Total Budget Expense Growth Breakdown

6.8% total budget expense growth driven by safety & training, including FTA directive response

Breakdown of FY24 Budget Growth

- Safety & Training (including FTA response), 3%
- Service Expansions, 1%
- Purchased Transit, 1%
- Fuel & Utilities, 1%
- All Other Net Changes, 1%
- 6.8%
Fare Revenue Recovery Ratio

- Fare revenue recovery ratio of 19% as operating expense growth exceeds fare revenue growth
  - $418M in fare revenue and $2,211M in operating expenses in FY24 budget
  - $474M in fare revenue and $1,987M in operating expenses in FY23 budget
- Prior to COVID-19, fare revenue recovery ratio had stabilized at 43% by FY19
- Fare revenue recovery ratio demonstrates the portion of fare revenue supporting or funding operating expenses (excluding debt service payments)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Fare Revenue</th>
<th>Operating Expenses</th>
<th>Recovery Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FY15</td>
<td>$418M</td>
<td>$2,211M</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY16</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY17</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY18</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY19</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY20</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY21</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY22</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY23 Budget</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY23 Q1 &amp; Q2</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY24 Budget</td>
<td>$474M</td>
<td>$1,987M</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pre-pandemic actuals
## FY24 Preliminary Budget Balance Summary

- FY24 initial budget gap of $366M fully offset through one-time revenues and transfers

- $285M of various one-time sources, including $186M proposed in Governor’s H.1 budget
  - $181M in one-time capital investments from Governor’s FY24 H.1 budget recommendation to be transferred to the capital budget
  - $68M of already appropriated $378M in one-time state assistance funds for FTA safety directive response
  - $31M in estimated FEMA reimbursement revenue for cleaning and PPE expenses already incurred in prior years
  - $5M in one-time state assistance for start-up costs for a means-tested fare program as included in the Governor’s FY24 H.1 budget recommendation

- $261M Deficiency Fund reserve transfer, below latest Pro Forma constraints
  - November 2022 Pro Forma modeled up to $270M Deficiency Fund transfer, depending on the level of fare revenue

### Description ($M) | Amount ($M)
--- | ---
Recurring Revenues | 2,363
Total Expenses | 2,728
**Initial Budget Gap** | (366)
One-time sources | 285
One-time Capital Investment Transfer | (181)
Deficiency Fund Reserves | 261
**FY24 Net Revenue (after transfers)** | 0
Next Steps in Operating Budget Planning

1. **Final Budget Presentation**
2. **Tracking & Reporting on Current Year Budget Variances**
3. **Preliminary Budget Presentations**
4. **Budget Preview Presentation**
5. **Formulate Budget Requests for Safety & Service Needs**
6. **Five-Year Pro Forma Presentation**

**Risks/Opportunities for FY24**

**Budget Tracking & Reporting**
Request of the Board: Budget Vote

• It is VOTED:

• To approve the Authority’s itemized budget of current operating expenses and debt service costs, for a one-year period from July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024, in the amount of $2,728,126,655, as presented May 25, 2023; and

• That the General Manager is hereby authorized and directed to submit the approved itemized budget, in the name and on behalf of the Authority, to the MBTA Advisory Board no later than June 15, 2023 in accordance with Section 20 of Chapter 161A of the Massachusetts General Laws; and
Recap of FY24 – FY28 Budget Projections from Pro Forma Presentation

Including Initial (June) FTA directive spending and one-time revenues

- One-time reserve revenues are projected to resolve the budget gap in FY24 and FY25 under higher fare revenue scenarios
- Actual budget gaps depend on fare revenue and actual spending over the next two years

FY26-FY28 projections carry greater uncertainty, planned updates to be provided at least annually
Maintaining a Forward-Looking Approach

- As done the last three years, continuing to transfer favorable budget results in FY24 into the Deficiency Fund will mitigate FY25 budget gap depending on any realized exposures or opportunities.
- Voting to sequester favorability to the Deficiency Fund from FY21 - FY23 has remedied recent budget gaps on a year-to-year basis.

Maintaining Deficiency Fund Transfers Policy

- Temporarily mitigates potential budget gaps in future years.
- Protects against potential budget risks in the upcoming year.
- Funding source for new/unbudgeted initiatives and priorities.
Request of the Board: Deficiency Fund

• It is VOTED:

• To authorize the transfer of surpluses, defined as total revenues less total expenses, above the amounts identified in the adopted FY24 budget, as may be amended, to the Operating Budget Deficiency Fund to mitigate the projected deficit in FY25 or FY26 and any other current or future obligations.
Appendix
FY24 Operating Budget Process

• Beginning with the November Pro Forma, several budget presentations have been made to the Board to approve guiding principles, detail safety and service investments, and provide historical spending and revenue data.
FY24 Spending Budget Overview

- 81% of FY24 budget spending is operating expenses
  - 38% for wages and benefits to operate and support service systemwide
  - 25% for purchased transit to run commuter rail, RIDE, ferry, and other local service
  - 17% for materials, supplies, and services, including fuel, cleaning, and utilities
  - 1% for all other remaining expenses
- Remaining 19% for debt service and the cost of borrowing for capital improvements and maintenance
FY24 Revenue Budget Overview

- 81% of FY24 budget revenue is subsidy (non-operating) revenue
  - Sales tax revenue is 55% of total
  - State assistance is 17% of total revenue, with more than half being one-time
  - Local assessment is 7% of total revenue
- Fare revenue accounts for 16% of total revenue
- Other operating (own-source) revenue accounts for remaining 3%
Revenue Summary & Assumptions

- **Fare revenue** and **Other operating revenue** (parking, advertising, real estate, etc.) decrease consistent with updated FY24 modal projection update.
- **Sales tax revenue** carried at consensus state tax estimates under the Governor’s FY24 H.1 budget recommendation to the Legislature.
- **State assistance** increase, beyond $187M in recurring assistance, reflects additional one-time funding assistance for multiple investments:
  - $181M in one-time state assistance for capital projects, as proposed in H.1.
  - $68M of already appropriated $378M in one-time state assistance for FTA safety directive response.
  - $5M in one-time state assistance for start-up costs for a means-tested fare program in H.1.
- **Federal revenue** reflects anticipated FEMA reimbursement for cleaning and PPE expenses already incurred in prior years.
- **Net transfers** includes $261M in Deficiency Fund reserve funds to balance operating budget gap offset by $181M transfer for one-time capital investments per FY24 H.1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item (Figures in millions)</th>
<th>FY23 Budget</th>
<th>FY24 Budget</th>
<th>$ Change</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fare Revenue</td>
<td>474.3</td>
<td>418.5</td>
<td>(55.9)</td>
<td>-12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Operating Revenue</td>
<td>82.6</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>(0.1)</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal Operating</strong></td>
<td>556.9</td>
<td>500.9</td>
<td>(56.0)</td>
<td>-10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Tax</td>
<td>1,325.1</td>
<td>1,463.5</td>
<td>138.4</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Assessment</td>
<td>183.8</td>
<td>188.4</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Assistance</td>
<td>187.0</td>
<td>441.4</td>
<td>254.4</td>
<td>136%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Income</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>31.4</td>
<td>(0.7)</td>
<td>-2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal Non-operating</strong></td>
<td>1,740.9</td>
<td>2,147.4</td>
<td>406.5</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Revenue</strong></td>
<td>2,297.8</td>
<td>2,648.3</td>
<td>350.5</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Transfers</td>
<td>255.7</td>
<td>79.8</td>
<td>(175.9)</td>
<td>-69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Sources</strong></td>
<td>2,553.5</td>
<td>2,728.1</td>
<td>174.6</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table compares FY23 Board approved budget to FY24 preliminary budget assumptions.
Spending Summary & Assumptions

• **Wages and benefits** increase accounts for additional headcount for FTA safety directive response, additional safety & training, Bus Network Redesign, and collective bargaining agreements
  - 7,643 operating budget positions, 964 (14%) above the FY23 budget

• **Materials, Supplies, & Services** includes $24M for FTA directive response costs for professional services contracts, PPE, and recruiting along with added scope of multiple contracts to include GLX service locations and other inflationary pressures

• **Commuter rail** includes fixed price contractual cost increase combined with additional scope changes in preparation for South Coast Rail service and flexibility for peak ridership service expansion

• **Debt service** consistent with obligations associated with capital borrowing costs while managing the overall stability of the long-term debt portfolio

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>FY23 Budget</th>
<th>FY24 Budget</th>
<th>$ Change</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wages &amp; Benefits</td>
<td>932.0</td>
<td>1,036.7</td>
<td>104.8</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials, Supplies, &amp; Services</td>
<td>365.5</td>
<td>453.9</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Operating Expenses</td>
<td>37.9</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commuter Rail</td>
<td>503.5</td>
<td>522.7</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The RIDE</td>
<td>126.2</td>
<td>127.1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferry</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Local Service Subsidy</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal Operating</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,987.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,211.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>224.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>11%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Service</td>
<td>566.5</td>
<td>516.9</td>
<td>(49.5)</td>
<td>-9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Expenses</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,553.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,728.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>174.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>7%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table compares FY23 Board approved budget to FY24 preliminary budget assumptions
Operating, Non-operating, & One-time Federal Revenues

- 80% of FY24 total revenues from non-operating sources subsidizing service across the system
  - Fares and other own-source revenues account for less than 20% of total revenue
  - Prior to COVID-19, non-operating revenue made up approximately 65% of annual total revenues

- $2,147M in non-operating (subsidy) revenue in FY24
  - Sales tax revenue of $1,464M represents more than half (55%) of total FY24 revenue
  - $31M in one-time FEMA reimbursement revenue for cleaning and PPE

- $501M in fare and own-source (operating) revenue, down $56M or -10% from FY23 budget
  - Down $261M or -34% from pre-pandemic
Approved FY24 Ridership Growth Projection

- FY24 budget includes an updated model for fare revenue, as directed by the Board during March 2023 Budget Preview Presentation.

- Using observed ridership data for each mode, FY24 projections have been updated to better align with current actual data.

- Updated model provides projection for overall growth, customized by mode.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>FY23 Q1 &amp; Q2 Average</th>
<th>FY24 Budget Assumption</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bus</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rail</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commuter Rail</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The RIDE</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferry</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Modes (Total)</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage relative to monthly baseline established from actual ridership in the 12 months prior to the pandemic.
State and Local Revenue Sources

- State and local funds make up a portion of the MBTA’s overall annual revenue
  - **Sales tax revenue** funds 54% of FY24 budgeted expenses
  - **Local assessment** funds 7% of FY24 budgeted expenses
  - **Recurring state assistance of $187M**, as approved in the annual state budget funds 7% of FY24 budgeted expenses
- Addition of various **one-time revenue sources** have mitigated budget gaps stemming from fare revenue collection and new initiatives
  - Total $378M already appropriated for **FTA safety directive response** efforts
    - $266M in reimbursement funds per Chapter 268 of the Acts of 2022 to be provided
    - $112M per Chapter 268 of the Acts of 2022 fully received
  - $181M in **one-time capital investments** from Governor’s FY24 H.1 budget recommendation
  - $5M in **one-time state assistance** for start-up costs for a means-tested fare program as included in the Governor’s FY24 H.1 budget recommendation
  - **$20M proposed in supplemental funding bill from the Governor for hiring and training in March 2023**

![State & Local Revenue Sources ($M)](image)
Own-Source Operating Revenue

- $82M own-source revenue projection in FY24, nearly level to FY23 budget
  - Own-source revenues correlated with ridership, but not as directly impacted as fare revenue
  - Real estate revenues more resilient to ridership variability
  - Parking revenue mostly correlated with commuter rail ridership, which has outperformed expectations
- Own-source revenue represents only 3% of total FY24 revenue
- Past initiatives to increase revenues include:
  - Reprocured advertising contracts with industry-leading commercial terms
  - Installed network of digital advertising and customer information panels which drove incremental advertising
  - Updated parking pricing across network

Own Source Revenue History by Category ($M)

- Parking revenue excludes any debt service or securitization payments
Operating Expense Breakdown

- 84% ($1,860M) of operating expenses directly tied to service transportation and system maintenance
  - 60% ($1,337M) directly supports all service and transportation including rail yard safety and service expansions like GLX and Bus Network Redesign
  - 24% ($523M) for system and vehicle maintenance, safety, and security
- 16% ($351M) to support service delivery like the new Quality Compliance Oversight Office as well as hiring, recruiting, and customer experience

Operating expenses do not include debt service payments. Total expenses are operating expenses plus debt service payments.
Optimizing Debt Portfolio for Debt Service Savings

AAA ratings
- Improved coverage ratios to enhance credit quality, recognized by highest attainable rating category by Fitch and Kroll

Proactive Budget Savings
## Special Directive 22-4

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take nine required actions.
- These required actions are to address deficiencies in personal protective equipment and right of way safety; to correct defective track conditions; and to address management practices that negatively impact track repair.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Special Directive 22-4</th>
<th>FTA-TRA-22-001</th>
<th>FTA-TRA-22-002</th>
<th>FTA-TRA-22-003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTA-TRA-22-001</strong></td>
<td>• Establish consistent PPE requirements for ROW personnel access</td>
<td>• Implement and document consistent MOW compliance with ROW safety procedures, including PPE requirements for all personnel</td>
<td>• Correct the track defects between Tufts Medical Center and Back Bay Stations on both north- and south-bound tracks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTA-TRA-22-004</strong></td>
<td>• Document MOW maintenance needs and develop and implement a schedule to ensure adequate track access to meet maintenance requirements</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Expedite and resource the transition to the new Enterprise Asset Management (EAM) system and formalize/implement procedures and protocols to ensure MOW managers and MOW inspectors share information and establish data-driven maintenance priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTA-TRA-22-007</strong></td>
<td>• Develop and implement a process and reporting procedure that accurately communicates the number, severity, and significance of MOW defects to Executive Leadership</td>
<td>• Develop and implement work plans to address MOW maintenance needs and manage on-going MOW workload</td>
<td>• Restore Green Line work train capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTA-TRA-22-008</strong></td>
<td>• Develop and implement a special maintenance repair plan to reduce the percentage of system track that is under a speed restriction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FTA-TRA-22-009</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Special Directive 22-5

• This Special Directive mandates that MBTA undertake three required actions

• These required actions address the pattern of safety incidents and interim safety findings concerning unintended and uncontrolled train movements by disabled trains in maintenance facilities and rail yards

FTA-VSC-22-001

• Develop and implement specific written procedures for yard movements of rail vehicles with known or suspected defective brakes or propulsion equipment

FTA-VSC-22-002

• Develop training and train personnel on the policies and procedures to safely move rail vehicles with known or suspected defects

FTA-VSC-22-003

• Create and implement a compliance program to ensure personnel consistently and accurately use policies and procedures for yard movements of rail vehicles with known or suspected defects
Special Directive 22-6

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take seven required actions.

- These required actions address the pattern of safety incidents and interim safety findings related to actions within the Operations Control Center at MBTA.

### FTA-OCC-22-001
- Ensure that staff working in the OCC, including dispatchers and supervisors, are certified.

### FTA-OCC-22-002
- Ensure OCC staff have sufficient time off to recover between shifts, consistent with MBTA hours of service policy for rail transit motorpersons.

### FTA-OCC-22-004
- Develop and enforce policies that require OCC personnel to work in a rested state.

### FTA-OCC-22-005
- Adequately staff the OCC for current operational needs and provide a plan to meet the operational needs of the system.

### FTA-OCC-22-007
- Verify that all dispatchers working within the OCC are current in their certifications prior to starting their shift.

### FTA-OCC-22-003
- Submit to FTA and DPU each week that for each shift, OCC supervisors and managers are not dual scheduled for both supervisory duties and dispatcher duties at any time during assigned shifts.

### FTA-OCC-22-006
- Identify and address major challenges in recruiting and training new rail transit dispatchers, the quality and performance of their training, and the certification of new candidates.
Special Directive 22-7

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA undertake three required actions

- These required actions address the pattern of safety incidents and interim safety findings concerning lapsed training certifications of safety-sensitive rail personnel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FTA-LC-22-001</th>
<th>FTA-LC-22-002</th>
<th>FTA-LC-22-003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Ensure that staff operating revenue service trains and supervising train movements and revenue service trains are certified</td>
<td>• Ensure that personnel with lapsed certifications are not placed on duty to perform or supervise train operations</td>
<td>• Create, review, and/or update its training materials to include; training and certification manuals for each line, to include manuals for operators and supervisors; updated rulebooks for all train lines, enforce version control; a compilation of temporary and permanent orders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Special Directive 22-9

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take four required actions.
- The findings and required actions outlined in this Special Directive will assist the MBTA in focusing its attention on balancing demands from operations and capital projects with workforce capacity and capability to inform resource prioritization.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT1-1</th>
<th>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT1-2</th>
<th>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT1-3</th>
<th>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT1-4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Conduct and submit to FTA a workforce analysis and associated workforce planning</td>
<td>• Develop and implement a recruitment and hiring plan to address findings from its workforce analysis and associated workforce planning for at least a five-year period, including how it will expand its capabilities for recruiting and hiring personnel to fill operations, maintenance, and capital project delivery positions</td>
<td>• Modify safety engineering and certification requirements for its capital projects and vehicle procurements and ensure they are addressed through additional E&amp;M and Safety Department staffing, contractor resources, or a combination of approaches. This may be done as part of the workforce analysis in Finding 1, or as part of a separate initiative</td>
<td>• Review the inspection and resident engineering resources needed to ensure compliance with MBTA safety rules related to the Right of Way to ensure the safety of personnel while in active work zones through additional staffing, contractor resources, or a combination of approaches</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Draft for Discussion & Policy Purposes Only
This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take six required actions:

- Conduct a critical and comprehensive review of its entire SMS planning, implementation, and operational processes and activities to address the gaps discussed in this finding.

- Update its SMS Implementation Plan to reflect the results of this review, including defined actions, timeframes, responsibilities, and expected outcomes.

This Special Directive identifies action that the MBTA must take to enhance and expedite implementation of the agency’s SMS, including the development of procedures, safety management training, safety risk assessment, and safety assurance activities to build the organization’s capability to identify safety concerns and to prioritize action to mitigate safety risk.
Special Directive 22-10 (2 of 2)

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take six required actions
- This Special Directive identifies action that the MBTA must take to enhance and expedite implementation of the agency’s SMS, including the development of procedures, safety management training, safety risk assessment, and safety assurance activities to build the organization’s capability to identify safety concerns and to prioritize action to mitigate safety risk

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-5.A</th>
<th>Develop and document criteria for conducting safety risk assessments consistent with the basic principles of safety management and the tenets of SMS as conveyed in FTA’s SMS guidance materials</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-5.B</td>
<td>Develop explicit direction for the ownership of safety risk assessments among the Safety Department and the operating departments. Documentation must include providing explicit roles, responsibilities, and thresholds of authority of each department involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-5.C</td>
<td>Ensure that operating departments including subject matter expertise, own safety risk assessments, while safety officials provide support for safety risk assessments and reports on results to Executive Leadership for safety resource allocation priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-5.D</td>
<td>Expand its policy of establishing a predefined schedule of safety risk assessment workshops and develop criteria attuned with the nature of hazard identification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-6.A</td>
<td>Evaluate (and correct) the data contained in its hazard log and safety risk mitigation log for accuracy and relevancy to SMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-6.B</td>
<td>Expedite the build out of its safety risk and safety risk mitigation monitoring information tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT2-6.C</td>
<td>Demonstrate use of its safety information management tools to effectively prioritize its resources to address the results of safety risk monitoring and safety performance monitoring</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Special Directive 22-11

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take three required actions:

  1. Develop and describe, in the organization’s SMS documentation, instructions regarding the conduct, recording, communication and follow up of the outcome consensus decisions. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-1.A)

  2. Develop explicit and formal guidelines for the expected role and contribution of frontline employees to the local safety committee meetings. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-2.A)

  3. Expedite the development of an effective ESRP as a fundamental source of safety information for hazard identification and safety performance monitoring. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-3.A)

- This Special Directive identifies action that the MBTA must take to improve MBTA’s management of its safety committee process, employee safety reporting program, and safety promotion activities:

  1. Develop explicit and formal guidelines for the expected role and contribution of frontline employees to the local safety committee meetings. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-1.B)

  2. Develop instructions for the conduct of the meetings, including explicit departmental accountabilities for meeting outcome information capture, communication and follow up. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-2.B)

  3. Provide explicit direction to frontline employees on what to report and what not to report through the ESRP. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-3.B)

  4. Provide refresher training to stakeholder personnel on the role of employee safety reporting within SMS and the crucial contribution managers and supervisors play in the development of an effective safety reporting context. (FTA-22-MBTA-CAT3-3.C)
Special Directive 22-12 (1 of 3)

**This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take seven required actions**

- Each operating and maintenance department must establish and act on a prioritized list of most frequently violated rules and procedures with the most significant potential safety consequences.

- Each department must develop and implement approaches, which could include audits, use of checklists and guides, Campaigns, and training, to improve compliance.

- The Safety Department must review and audit these reports and compile a monthly compliance report for MBTA’s executive leadership team.

- Each department must continue to review safety data to assess effectiveness of actions and to improve compliance with safety rules and procedures.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Special Directive 22-12 (2 of 3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take seven required actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This Special Directive identifies requiring action that the MBTA must take to improve MBTA’s management of its operating and maintenance policies, monitoring of rail transit operations, Quality Assurance/Quality Control capabilities, and training and procedures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Develop, document, and communicate a mechanism to monitor operations, and provide training to stakeholder safety and operating personnel on this mechanism, to enable the analysis and understanding of situations of non-compliance</td>
<td>• Develop and administer a QA/QC program to independently oversee QA/QC activities</td>
<td>• Ensure that the QA/QC functions are independent of the functions of the Safety department and report directly to the GM</td>
<td>• Develop a formal QA/QC procedure that details the oversight of and accountability and roles and responsibilities for QA/QC programs provided by railcar manufacturers and MBTA consultants related to quality control of its railcars and subcomponents</td>
<td>• Ensure that the MBTA QA/QC independent group is staffed with a sufficient SMEs in necessary disciplines to ensure a complete and thorough understanding of the responsibilities under the purview of railcar maintenance and engineering</td>
<td>• Conduct a training needs assessment for rail transit operations and maintenance departments, to include emergency response training. This assessment should identify training that needs to be updated, developed, and supported with additional resources</td>
<td>• Implement the results of the training needs assessment</td>
<td>• Consider opportunities and adopt technology and other resources to support training development and training management and record-keeping</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Special Directive 22-12 (3 of 3)

- This Special Directive mandates that MBTA take seven required actions.
- This Special Directive identifies requiring action that the MBTA must take to improve MBTA’s management of its operating and maintenance policies, monitoring of rail transit operations, Quality Assurance/Quality Control capabilities, and training and procedures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Directive</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT4-5.A</td>
<td>Review its existing maintenance rules and procedures; identify opportunities for tools and checklists to support employees in carrying out maintenance rules and procedures; and develop, distribute, maintain, and update these materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT4-5.B</td>
<td>Include frontline maintenance personnel in the development evaluation of these tools and checklists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT4-6</td>
<td>Evaluate expanding its existing mentoring program from Bus Transit Operations to include new part-time and full-time rail transit operators or consider establishing a mentoring program specific to rail transit operations. In its evaluation, MBTA should consider opportunities and resources to support the professional development of rail transit operations personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT4-7.A</td>
<td>Confirm radio dead spots with frontline motorpersons and maintenance workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA-22-MBTA-CAT4-7.B</td>
<td>Improve the performance of its radio system in these dead spots</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recent Investments for Safety, Service, & New Initiatives

Operating Safety Budgeted Positions Added Since FY20

- Increase That Year & Cumulative Total

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Budgeted Positions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FY21</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY22</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY23</td>
<td>424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY24</td>
<td>1,068</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Cumulative Total

1,688 new positions added to the operating budget since FY20, including 1,068 positions for safety and training

All Budgeted Positions Added Since FY20 by Output & Department Mission

- Service & Transportation, 882
- System Maintenance & Security, 523
- Service Delivery Support, 283
FY24 New Safety Positions Budgeted

- 644 new budgeted positions specifically designated for safety & training
- 455 positions for FTA safety directive response
  - 97 positions, including trackpersons, equipment operators, and engineers, addressing right of way safety, track repair, and consistent PPE requirements (Directive 22-04)
  - 153 positions, including motorpersons and repair forepersons, addressing rail yard and maintenance facility safety surrounding train movements (Directive 22-05)
  - 49 positions, including OCC staff and inspectors, enhancing staffing, capacity, and policies at Operations Control Center (Directive 22-06)
  - 38 positions, including instructors, ensuring proper certifications and training material for safety-sensitive rail personnel (Directive 22-07)
  - 37 positions, including HR recruiters and staff, coordinating and executing a workforce assessment to understand capacity along improved recruitment and hiring plan (Directive 22-09)
  - 16 positions, including analysts and specialists, enhancing safety communication, procedures, training, and safety assurance and mitigate risk (Directive 22-10)
  - 4 positions, including systems safety specialists, improving safety management, reporting, and process (Directive 22-11)
  - 28 positions, including engineers and quality control managers, developing operating and maintenance policies on rail transit operations, QA/QC, and procedures (Directive 22-12)
  - 33 positions, including the new Quality Compliance and Oversight Office (QCOO), supporting all directives including medical, diversity, technology, financial reporting, and purchasing
- 189 positions for additional safety and training for proper staffing levels, certification, and supervision including 38 positions for bus transportation, 67 positions for heavy and light rail, 31 for transit facilities maintenance, and 26 instructors more instructors and the newly created Training department

$63M in annual wages
FY23 New Safety Positions Budgeted

- **148 new budgeted positions specifically designated for safety**
- 28 positions for transit facilities maintenance for mechanical and station inspections to avoid potential interruptions
- 26 positions for heavy rail to support rail yard safety, along with the additional training and testing of new Red and Orange Line vehicles
- 18 positions for rail maintenance for proactive inspections, implement additional QA/QC functions, improved cleanliness, tool calibration, and defective part replacements
- 15 positions for light rail yard safety and to prepare and support vehicles for revenue service for the Green Line Extension
- 11 positions for power systems maintenance to increase supervisory capacity, including vertical transportation contracts like escalators and elevators
- 10 positions for signals and communication maintenance including engineers to address the movement towards more advanced, specialized, technical nature of equipment
- 7 positions for engineering to manage and improve quality on all modes, including signal and tracks
- 5 positions for bus transportation for additional inspectors and supervisors
- Remaining 22 positions support efforts in and across multiple departments including Chief Operating Officer, Security Department, Safety Department, OCC & Training, and Maintenance of Way

Operations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safety</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>148 positions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$15M in annual wages
FY22 Additional Safety Positions Budgeted

- 125 new budgeted positions for safety
- 78 positions for system and vehicle maintenance, including system repairers and technicians
- 32 positions for transportation safety, including rapid transit motorpersons and bus supervisors
- 10 positions for operations planning and training, including dispatchers and supervisors
- 5 positions for security, including system administrators
- These additional positions improve transportation and system safety and reliability with the added benefit of reducing overtime

Operations Safety

- 125 positions
- $11M in annual wages
FY21 Additional Safety Positions Budgeted

• **151 new budgeted positions for safety**
• New positions targeting three priorities:
  • Preventative maintenance inspections
    • Includes fire suppression systems, stand pipes, bridges, switch machines, catenary wires, and tracks
  • Overnight supervision
    • Respond to emergencies, manage overnight activities, and prepare for morning service
  • Training programs
    • Increase ride reports, employee training, performance reviews, audits, and course materials
• Full breakdown of positions by department/area:
  • 80 for system maintenance
  • 20 for transportation departments
  • 20 for safety department
  • 18 for vehicle maintenance
  • 13 among all other departments

**Operations**

**Safety**

151 positions

$12M in annual wages
### Additional Service & Maintenance Highlights & Improvements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Green Line Train Protection System (GLTPS)</strong></td>
<td>- Initial stages of preparation for using onboard alerts and communications to automatically stop the train to avoid collisions and enhance safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Engineering Audits</strong></td>
<td>- Increase audits on bridges, platforms, stairs, and facilities infrastructure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RIDE Revenue Vehicles</strong></td>
<td>- Full maintenance audit on all RIDE revenue vehicles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Increasing Rail Maintenance Personnel Pipeline</strong></td>
<td>- Trainee program to increase recruiting and expand candidate pool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bus Stop Signage</strong></td>
<td>- Expanded efforts to keep in a state of good repair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Contracted Bus Service Team</strong></td>
<td>- Proactive approach in planning for any service diversions to mitigate issues for riders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Federal Relief Funding Update

- Three major federal relief packages totaling $1,988M in expected reimbursement for operating expenses to make up for lost fare revenues
  - Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act
  - Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplemental Appropriations Act of 2021 (CRRSAA)
  - American Rescue Plan Act of 2021 (ARPA)
- All funds fully claimed by June 2022 to mitigate current and future year budget gaps
  - All $827M in CARES Act funding fully claimed for reimbursement between FY20 and FY21
  - All $301M in CRRSAA funding fully claimed for reimbursement between FY21 and FY22
  - All $860M in ARPA fully claimed by the end of June 2022
Historical Year Over Year Annual Revenue Growth

• Since FY19, reduced operating revenue has been offset by one-time federal and state assistance
  • FY24 budget operating revenue down 34% from FY19
• 15% total revenue growth in FY24 budget reflects infusion of one-time state assistance from Governor’s budget recommendation for capital investments and means-tested (low-income) fare program

Annual Revenue Growth By Category Since the Pandemic

- FY23 reduction reflects fully claiming all one-time federal pandemic relief funds
Low-Income (Means-tested) Fare Program Summary

**Purpose**

Low-Income Fares expands fare affordability across the MBTA modes, addressing an existing gap for the low-income population ages 26-64.

**Development & Launch**

Developing and launching a Low-Income Fare program is currently estimated to require at least 12 months with project implementation costs of approximately $5 million. Key elements include the standard fare change process, changes to fare collection technology and fare media, the implementation of an online application, and onboarding of internal and partner staff in Community Based Organizations.

**5-Year Cost**

We expect $2.4 million of ongoing annual administrative costs, with fare revenue losses and operating costs growing from $22 million in year 1 through a steady state of $53 million in year 5.

**Broad MBTA Financial Context**

The Governor’s FY24 H.1 recommendation included $5M in one-time start-up costs. Going forward, the future fare revenue loss would incrementally increase our future year funding gaps and would require additional funding and/or reprioritization with other important initiatives impacting the Operating Budget.
**FY24 Monthly Fare Revenue Projections**

- FY24 fare revenue assumption of $418M, 60% of pre-pandemic baseline
  - Updated modal ridership based projection
  - Incorporates new data on actual ridership patterns observed since the pandemic
  - Higher than the 49%-55% realized through Q1 & Q2 of FY23
  - Adjusts for seasonality in ridership
  - Consistent with Board direction from FY24 Budget Preview presentation in March 2023

![FY24 Monthly Fare Revenue Summary](image-url)

- Percentage of Baseline
- Fare Revenue ($M)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Revenue ($)</th>
<th>Ridership (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jul-23</td>
<td>$37</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aug-23</td>
<td>$37</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sep-23</td>
<td>$36</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct-23</td>
<td>$39</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov-23</td>
<td>$33</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec-23</td>
<td>$32</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan-24</td>
<td>$35</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feb-24</td>
<td>$32</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar-24</td>
<td>$33</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apr-24</td>
<td>$34</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May-24</td>
<td>$35</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jun-24</td>
<td>$35</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Peer Agency Revenue for Operations Breakdown

**Boston MBTA**
- FY19: $2.2B
- FY21: $2.6B

**New York MTA**
- FY19: $15.2B
- FY21: $17.2B

**Philadelphia SEPTA**
- FY19: $1.4B
- FY21: $1.4B

**Washington WMATA**
- FY19: $1.9B
- FY21: $1.9B

**Chicago CTA**
- FY19: $1.5B
- FY21: $1.6B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System Revenue %</th>
<th>2019 Rank</th>
<th>2021 Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MTR</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TfL</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMATA</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTA</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBTA</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TransLink</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**System Revenues**
- (e.g. Fares, Own Source)

**Non-System Revenue**
- (e.g. Sales Tax, Local Assessments)
Peer Revenues for Operations by Category: Covid Impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>FY19</th>
<th>FY21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operating Budget</strong></td>
<td>$2.2B</td>
<td>$2.6B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subway Fare</strong></td>
<td>$2.40</td>
<td>$2.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Other</td>
<td>62.2%</td>
<td>31.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Federal Grants</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State &amp; Local Subsidies and Taxes</td>
<td>31.0%</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fares</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>55.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>WASHINGTON WMATA</strong></th>
<th>FY19</th>
<th>FY21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operating Budget</strong></td>
<td>$1.9B</td>
<td>$1.9B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subway Fare</strong></td>
<td><em>$2.00 - $6.00</em></td>
<td>$2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Other</td>
<td>57.9%</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Federal Grants</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>53.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State &amp; Local Subsidies and Taxes</td>
<td>35.7%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fares</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>PHILADELPHIA SEPTA</strong></th>
<th>FY19</th>
<th>FY21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operating Budget</strong></td>
<td>$1.4B</td>
<td>$1.4B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subway Fare</strong></td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Other</td>
<td>57.1%</td>
<td>34.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Federal Grants</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State &amp; Local Subsidies and Taxes</td>
<td>33.6%</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fares</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>CHICAGO CTA</strong></th>
<th>FY19</th>
<th>FY21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Operating Budget</strong></td>
<td>$1.5B</td>
<td>$1.6B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subway Fare</strong></td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Other</td>
<td>55.3%</td>
<td>60.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Federal Grants</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State &amp; Local Subsidies and Taxes</td>
<td>39.3%</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fares</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Categorization of Revenue & Expenses

**Total Revenue**

- **Operating Revenue**
  - Fares
  - Own-source
  - Parking, Advertising, Real Estate

- **Subsidy (Non-operating) Revenue**
  - Sales Tax, One-time Federal Funds, State Appropriation, Local Assessment

**Total Expenses**

- **Operating Expenses**
  - Wages & Benefits
  - Materials & Services

- **Debt Service**
  - Purchased Transit
  - Commuter Rail, the RIDE, Ferry, Local Service

**Net Revenue** = **Total Revenue** – **Total Expenses**