Fare Transformation

Benefits, Efficiencies, and Future Opportunities

June 7, 2021

Adam Veneziano  Lynsey Heffernan  Elizabeth Winters Ronaldson
The Fare Transformation program is well underway. Today is a continuation of our updates to the Board reviewing expected project benefits and future opportunities against costs.

May 10th: Near-Term
- Update on reduced fare modernization and means-testing challenge
- Comparing fare equity strategies
- Discussion on fare evasion regulations
- Vote on mid-year tariff changes (Youth Pass, Outer Express)

May 24th: Medium-Term
- Fare strategy and promotions during transition to new normal
- Means Tested Fares update
- Fare Evasion Regulations

June 7th: Longer-Term
- Efficiencies of Fare Transformation project
  - Project Origins and Principles
  - Benefits
  - Net Costs
- Future revenue opportunities after Fare Transformation Phase 5
Origins and Principles
An outdated legacy system, evolution of customer expectations, and transformation of the mobility ecosystem required a significant reinvestment in our fare system.

### Current System
- Much of the system specification was written in 2001
- Discrepancy in systems and customer experience across transit modes
- Cumbersome process to change fare policy (3-6 months)
- Limitations to enforcing performance
- Frequent needs for investment in an aging system just to preserve existing capabilities
- Increasing operational costs and reliability challenges
- More work done in-house versus industry norm

### Changes Required and Enabled
- Create a comprehensive fare system platform
- Improve certainty around future performance costs
- Replace outdated technology
- Allow more rapid implementation of fare policy choices
- Accountability for performance and investment
- Strengthen intermodal transit integration and speed transit service

### Fare Transformation
- Meet customer expectations about self-service options and new ways to pay
- Address the need for a unified, integrated fare payment system
- Speed up bus and Green Line service through all door boarding
- Provide for a contracting method which provides for sustained performance and reinvestment
The Fare Transformation Program is the product of years of research and development and extensive public engagement, supported by continuous steering from the FMCB...

- All-door boarding
- Equitable sales network and rollout
- Extensive public engagement
- Privacy by design
- Charging for a card and allowing ‘one more ride’
- Flexible Performance based contract
- Leverage private financing
Benefits
... and is poised to provide the MBTA and its customers with a wide array of benefits and options for the future.

- **Better customer experience**
  Making paying for transit easier and more convenient

- **Focus on core operations**
  Removing cash from on board buses, Green Line trains, and Commuter Rail by supporting more options for customers to pay before they board

- **Support for the future MBTA**
  Enabling future flexibility for fare policy innovation and integrations with other transit services and modes of transport

- **Equal access**
  Offering expanded language support and accessibility improvements for seniors and people with disabilities

- **Improved revenue control**
  Delivering fully reconciled, auditable and accurate revenue deposits and reports and controlling fare evasion

- **Upgraded assets**
  Replacing worn equipment and improving system uptime and performance under performance-based contract
Fare Transformation also empowers the MBTA with greater fare policy flexibility which the MBTA has previously discussed.

Fare Transformation supports the future needs of the MBTA and its customers

The new system will enable future changes to fare structures and the ability to integrate with other transit and mobility providers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fare options</th>
<th>Example of possible implementation*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intermodal transfers</td>
<td>Transfer between bus, subway, ferry and Commuter Rail and pay with your Charlie Card</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time of day fares</td>
<td>Commute during off-peak hours and pay a lower fare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day of week fares</td>
<td>Ride the T on the weekend and pay a lower fare than on weekdays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced fare groups</td>
<td>Expand reduced fare programs and improve ease of application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Best value / capping</td>
<td>Rather than buying a weekly pass, pay only for rides you take on the bus and subway until the value of a 7 Day Link Pass is reached and then ride for free for the rest of the week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zonal / distance based fares</td>
<td>Pay a different fare based on where your journey starts and ends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reverse-commute fares</td>
<td>Pay a lower fare when you travel outbound in the morning and inbound in the evening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rolling period passes</td>
<td>30 day passes that can be purchased on any day instead of calendar month passes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer between carriers</td>
<td>Take a trip that involves both MBTA and Regional Transit Authority (RTA) services and pay for the whole thing with your Charlie Card, &amp; future partnerships with micro-mobility, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special event fares</td>
<td>Buy a special event pass to cover all of your travel to, from and during a special event</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Examples are intended to illustrate system capabilities, MBTA plans a robust public process on any new fare structures
The Fare Transformation Program supports an improved customer experience through the entire journey, from planning and account management to end destination... and back.

- **New tap targets** supporting all media
- New gates designed for safety and accessibility
- Tap on for all modes, including ferry
- Supports customer service
- Enables fare enforcement
- Distributed, accessible and diverse retail locations
- Sales network availability reported to MBTA
- Support from live agents
- 24/7 automated phone system for self-service
- Account management and product purchase
- Cashless vehicles speeds up boarding
- All-door boarding
- Taps on platform for Commuter and Mattapan Line)
- Station fare vending and streetscape fare vending machines at stations and bus stops
- All machines accept cash and accommodate a range of accessibility needs
- Self-service online account management
- Employers benefits management portal
- Works on all devices
- Easy to use mobile app
- Convenient top up via all sales channels
- Virtual Fare Card for customers in corporate/reduced fare programs
The performance-based contract structure provides a robust framework for managing the performance of the System Integrator and provide the MBTA with more stable future operating costs for fare collection.

Performance Incentives
- Deductions of up to 100% of each operating availability payments for performance failures
- Capital and operating availability payments can be withheld if Full Service Commencement is delayed
- Key Performance Indicators for all areas of system operation

Stability of future operating costs
- Availability payment structure guarantees a stable level of operating and transaction costs, which may be reduced for poor performance

Contractual Remedies
- Contract clauses are in place in the event of a change of control
- In the event of a meaningful SI failure the MBTA can terminate the contract for default

The contract structure provides a level of guarantee and efficiency that the Current Fare System does not
The Fare Transformation Program also incorporates improvements to the Commuter Rail system, resulting in a best in-class model for payments and operations.

**Integrates the customer experience of the Commuter Rail System into the rest of the MBTA’s network**
- Provides a single fare media solution for all modes, including Commuter Rail
- Consistent passenger experience – all modes require a tap
- Enables fare policy options of transfer discounts on Commuter Rail

**Provides opportunities for operational improvements**
- Better service planning from:
  - Detailed (but anonymized) origin and destination information
  - Integrated ridership data across modes – passenger transfers and mode usage
- Reduces workload of on-board train staff – conductors will be verifying payment, not handling cash and executing transactions

**Potential Future Opportunities**
- Underpins transformation of the rail system from a commuter rail network to regional rail system as part of an integrated network
- Opportunity to provide synergies with complementary services such as parking
Through Fare Transformation the MBTA will also benefit from new, integrated systems to better understand rider transit patterns and make data-driven decisions.

In order to better contextualize these benefits, it’s important to understand what the Current Fare System currently provides by way of data, what the Fare Transformation System will deliver, and how that can be leveraged by the MBTA...

Fare data gathered today is siloed and varies across modes and programs

Through Fare Transformation, the MBTA will better understand rider behavior across modes

Sensitive rider data protected by MBTA privacy policy and ‘privacy by design’ in the system
Net Costs
Although the Fare Transformation Program will provide a range of tangible benefits and flexibility to the MBTA, there is an incremental cost associated with implementation.

The MBTA has analyzed the incremental cost between continuing the basics of its current fare system and implementing the Fare Transformation Program (which encompasses all activities associated with making Fare Transformation possible, not just the Cubic contract)...

### Current Fare System
- Much of the system specification was written in 2001
- Discrepancy in systems and customer experience across transit modes
- Cumbersome process to change fare policy (3-6 months)
- Limitations to enforcing performance
- Frequent needs for investment in an aging system just to preserve existing capabilities
- Increasing operational costs and reliability challenges
- More work done in-house versus industry norm

### Fare Transformation Program
- State of the art fare collection system
- Advanced system functionality to provide better service to end-users
- Diversification in payment options
- Significant capital investment
- Robust lifecycle and O&M maintenance regime
- Capability to generate operational efficiencies which offset incremental cost

### Incremental Cost
- An analysis of the incremental cost to implement the Fare Transformation Program (relative to the costs the MBTA would have incurred to operate, maintain, and reinvest in its existing fare systems)
- This analysis was conducted on a nominal basis with inflation being applied to cost inputs over the term
- A 23-year capital and operating period was assumed
- Costs were mapped to key categories associated with operations of these type of systems
- Key cost drivers were identified and analyzed
- Sensitivities were applied on key assumptions to generate an incremental cost range
This incremental cost to realize all the benefits of Fare Transformation can be viewed through the lens of three primary cost categories, which capture the broad categories of investment underpinning the implementation and operation of the Fare Transformation Program versus those which would have been necessary with just the current fare system.

- **Transaction Processing and Variable Costs**
  - Include items such as credit card fees, cash management costs, and fare media costs
  - These costs are influenced by the amount of revenue generated and the method of payment by end users

- **Operations and Maintenance Costs**
  - Relate to the necessary support required to operate the systems
  - Includes availability payments for system operations & maintenance
  - Can be impacted by the level and appropriateness of capital investment (or lack thereof)
  - Does not include fare inspection or fare evasion implications

- **Capital and Development Costs**
  - Relate to the procurement, design, implementation, installation, integration, and testing of new systems and processes
  - Includes capital (debt & equity) portion of Availability Payments
  - Includes any required capital re-investment in legacy systems

All costs are expressed on a nominal basis (including inflation)

Net Cost/Benefit of All-Door Boarding = Net Incremental Cost
The new fare payment system enables all-door boarding, which translates effectively into operating efficiencies that the MBTA can then use, if possible given financial constraints, to deploy additional transit service

- Moving to a new fare system that features all-door boarding and takes cash transactions off vehicles is expected to reduce the amount of time vehicles spend at stops (dwell time)
- Aside from speeding up individual riders’ trips, this savings should reduce overall vehicle cycle times
- Impact will vary by route and stop, and time of day, but will be greatest during peak periods and at the busiest stops
- For bus, preliminary estimates suggest at least a 4% reduction in cycle times systemwide.
- Conservatively, this analysis also suggests at least a 2.4% reduction on the Green Line.
- If future financial constraints allow, the MBTA can redeploy these cycle time reductions as additional transit service as the efficiencies are realized. Increasing bus and Green Line service by that extent without all-door boarding would require capital investment and an increase in annual operating costs.

To estimate savings, this compares bus dwell times from 7/6/20 – 7/17/20 (when no fares were collected) with dwell times from 7/20/20 – 7/31/20 (when fare collection resumed) using data collected from the Automated Passenger Counter (APC) system.
Fare evasion is a risk that must be managed at all transit agencies, and Fare Transformation is providing additional tools to mitigate evasion even as the MBTA moves to all-door boarding on buses and trolleys.

- Fare evasion results in some fare revenue loss in the MBTA's current fare system.
- More reliable system equipment, gates on Commuter Rail, and providing more ways to pay will close existing loopholes in MBTA fare collection.

Example: Commuter Rail fare evasion and non-collection is estimated to cost the MBTA $10m-$20m p.a.

Policy decisions associated with all-door boarding on buses and surface Green Line are expected to increase fare evasion.

Specific impact will depend on policy and operational choices about fare enforcement.

- The MBTA has identified steps to help mitigate fare evasion under all-door boarding and incorporated those into Fare Transformation.
- Example: Fare gates at Commuter Rail stations will help to close existing loopholes.

- Rapid fare media scanning technology
- Commitment to a well-trained, specialized civilian workforce for fare verification
- Extensive customer transition and education programs
- Regulatory framework taking into account riders in the decision making
- Robust appeals and adjudication process.
The net incremental cost associated with Fare Transformation will be driven by future policy decisions around fare evasion regulations and fare verification.

**Fare Verification Cost and Fare Evasion Losses**
- $15m to $35m annually

**Efficiencies Analysis**
- Without Fare Transformation and all-door boarding, increasing bus and Green Line service by the same degree enabled by the project would require major capital investment and a significant increase in annual operating costs.
- The value of those efficiencies were estimated in the same manner used to present costs of incremental service to the FMCB in May re: means tested fares and free bus pilots.
- These efficiencies can go some way to offsetting the incremental costs associated with the Fare Transformation Program, though they are difficult to calculate.
- Net cost/benefit from all-door boarding will depend on future decisions, including around fare evasion regulations and the size of the fare verification team, and can range from being a significant cost, a wash, or a significant financial benefit.

**Potential Value of Operating Efficiency**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Vehicles (bus)</td>
<td>~$48m</td>
<td>One-time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Vehicle Replacement (bus)</td>
<td>~$5m</td>
<td>Annual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Operating Costs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~$19m bus</td>
<td></td>
<td>Annual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~$4.6m Green Line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Incremental System Implementation and Operating Cost**

- Net Cost/Benefit of All-Door Boarding

\[
\text{Net Incremental Cost} = \text{Net Incremental Cost Range} + \text{Efficiencies Analysis}
\]
Future Opportunities
Emerging providers and evolving customer needs are quickly changing the mobility landscape across the Commonwealth...

The MBTA faces changes brought on by the new mobility ecosystem

- **Technology**
  - TNCs (Uber, Lyft)
  - Bike Share
  - Car Share
  - Micro-Mobility

- **Users**
  - Higher user expectations
  - Changing behavior

- **Markets**
  - Mobile payment platforms
  - Banking solutions

- **Current operating environment**
  - MBTA operates high-capacity transit services
  - State of Good Repair backlog
  - Capacity constraints

- **System & service**
  - Rising O&M costs
  - Changing revenue mix
  - Innovative funding & financing tools

- **Funding & financing**
  - Covid-19 recovery
  - Road network congestion
  - Environmental concerns
... close coordination and collaboration will be vital to meet the evolving mobility needs of the Commonwealth...

Possible Future Goals

- Expand transportation options for underserved groups
- Improve safety on our roadways
- Reduce air pollution and promote sustainable mobility
- Coordinate the efficient use of shared space
- Build and foster healthy communities
- Increase transit ridership and/or revenues
... and there are varying degrees of integration that the Fare Transformation Program will enable, all of which further support existing and potential future policy objectives.

Fare policy objectives
- Raise revenue
- Improve service and customer experience
- Advance social, equity, environmental, and regional economic goals

Payment integration
- Your Charlie Card works to pay for a bikeshare ride with no discounts

Fare integration
- If you transfer from a Subway or Local Bus trip, your bikeshare ride is discounted — or —
- An employer-run shuttle bus accepts MBTA passes for travel.

Service integration
- MBTA service planners treat an employer shuttle bus as an extension of MBTA service when deciding what times and locations need MBTA-run service.

As complexity increases, so does MBTA’s scrutiny of partners for alignment with values/goals and balance of MBTA fare policy objectives

FMCB, December 2015

Equity
- Ridership
- Revenue

Technology
The MBTA will return to the Board in the future to define principles and goals of around Payment Platform Integration as the Fare Transformation program is delivered...

While the MBTA Fare Transformation process continues over the next several years, to support and define the MBTA's integrated fare platform in the mobility marketplace, the MBTA will...

- Define Principles and Goals of Payment Platform Integration
  - Balance equity, ridership, and revenue (fare policy) and safety, service, equity, and sustainability goals of the MBTA

- Identify Resources and Capacity
  - Understand staff and timeline needed to support

- Pilot and Implement
  - Scope and initiate pilots to understand interplay between providers through payment platform

- Pursue Mobility Partnerships
  - Identify and define incentives and options for mobility providers to integrate with MBTA payment platform

The MBTA’s current focus is on delivery of Fare Transformation and refining principles and goals of the program.

As the work evolves over the next few years, the MBTA will return to discuss resources for implementation.

MBTA must develop a framework and resources to support an integrated platform, allowing pilots to then be implemented.

Pilots will inform the possibility of future mobility partnerships across the Commonwealth.