



Charles D. Baker, Governor  
Karyn E. Polito, Lieutenant Governor  
Stephanie Pollack, MassDOT Secretary & CEO  
Steve Poftak, General Manager



**Fiscal and Management Control Board  
Transportation Board Room  
10 Park Plaza  
December 9, 2019  
12:00 p.m.  
*MEETING MINUTES***

**Present:** Chair Joseph Aiello, Director Monica Tibbits-Nutt, Director Brian Lang, Director Brian Shortsleeve (by phone), and Director Chrystal Kornegay (by phone)

**Quorum Present:** Yes

**Others Present:** Secretary Stephanie Pollack, General Manager Steve Poftak, Deputy General Manager Jeff Gonneville, David Abdoo, Hope Patterson, Marie Breen, Owen Kane, Michelle Kalowski, David Panagore, Laurel Paget-Seekins, William Wolfgang, Joe Cheever, Jeff Cook, Kat Benesh, Caroline Vanesse, Ron Renaud, Matthias Augustyniak, and Matt Cole

**Safety Review Panel Members:**

**Ray Lahood, Carmen Bianco, and Carolyn Flowers**

At the call of Chair Aiello a meeting of the Fiscal and Management Control Board (Board) was called to order at 12:05 p.m. at the State Transportation Building, Transportation Board Room, 10 Park Plaza, Boston, Massachusetts.

Secretary Pollack first acknowledged the passing of Frank DePaola on Saturday, December 7, 2019 and spoke of his effortless contribution to the MBTA,

[Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority](#)

[Ten Park Plaza, Boston, MA 02116](#)

[www.mbta.com](http://www.mbta.com)

Mass Highway and MassDOT. Ms. Pollack concluded with a moment of silence in his memory.

Next, Chairman Aiello announced that the Safety Review Panel had released their report this morning and would be making a presentation to the Board followed by Q & A. The Panel was formed in late June to review safety procedures and performance following the derailment of the Red Line in June where a train jumped the tracks as it headed into JFK/UMass station.

Chair Aiello first acknowledged and thanked Vice Chair Tibbits-Nutt for her efforts in assisting in the formation of the panel and then welcomed and introduced the Safety Panel: former Secretary of Transportation Ray LaHood; former FTA Administrator Carolyn Flowers; and former New York City Transit President Carmen Bianco.

Mr. LaHood began with an overview of the presentation and highlighted four points: the T is safe, but could be safer; there must be more focus on safety culture; additional resources needed to improve safety can be obtained with the help of Governor Baker and United States Transportation Secretary Chao; and that the work of the FMCB has done amazing work that everybody should be proud of.

Ms. Flowers next discussed the Safety Management System in detail and the need for a proactive premier safety culture.

Mr. Bianco continued with an overview of the Safety Review Panel (SRP) report. After conducting over 100 interviews, meetings with FTA, FRA, DPU, LTK, Keolis, visits with OCC, rail vehicle shops, GLX construction, ROW/RWP training, reviewing of policies, procedures and accident reports etc., the final report provided 34 recommendations, resulting in 61 individual corrective actions, several of which were already underway. Mr. Bianco noted major findings included a lack of safety culture and blame and retribution hindering safety efforts, lack of communications, poor use of data and lack of performance monitoring tools, insufficient staffing and budgetary obstacles, inadequacy of the Safety Department, and the frequency of FMCB meetings that takes an extraordinary toll on agency leadership, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Safety Review Panel Overview of Final Report, December 9, 2019".

Discussion ensued relating to the prioritization of recommendations timetable, headcount, resources and best practices for senior managers. The Safety Panel noted that some recommendations could be handled in parallel and the stronger the culture the easier it would become.

Mr. LaHood stated the MBTA had the leadership to get the work done, noting the situation was not unique and that other transit agencies with similar issues were now back on track.

Director Tibbits-Nutt accepted the report of the SRP and acknowledged the MBTA owed much gratitude to Secretary Ray LaHood, Ms. Flowers, Mr. Bianco and the team of professionals who all contributed to the report. Ms. Tibbits-Nutt said the findings were significant and its recommendations far reaching, and noted the Report would provide a roadmap of tangible actions that needed to be taken to ensure a best-in class safety culture at the MBTA.

Chair Aiello acknowledged it was the role of the Board to remain vigilant in monitoring the safety culture and practices and elevating its importance above competing priorities. The Chair noted the report was a reminder to hold the MBTA to the highest standards of safety, saying there was much work to be done. Chairman Aiello said, "This Board and our successor Board have a shared obligation with the Executive team, as we look forward to embarking on next steps."

General Manager Poftak thanked the SRP team and the FMCB for all their work noting it is clear that safety be the first priority at the MBTA. Mr. Poftak discussed initiatives already undertaken and said improving safety at the MBTA would require sustained attention from the senior management and additional financial resources. The General Manager stated he would return in March to further discuss initiatives underway and address additional findings in the report.

Chair Aiello announced the Board would take a short break at 1:25 p.m. before the public comment session began.

At 1:26 p.m., Chairman Aiello opened up the public comment period for items appearing on the agenda.

The first speaker, Connor Moulton from Transit Matters, commented on “trust and riders,” AFC legacy change and transparency.

Next, Tim Lasker President of Local 453, commented on MBTA employee culture and communication.

Next, Roxana Rivera of SEIU 32 BJ commented on the station cleaning contracts.

Next, Staci Rubin from the Conservation Law Foundation commented on better Fairmount service, electric buses and the fare transformation effort.

Next, Louise Baxter from the T Riders Union commented on Charlie Cards on the Fairmount Line and fare transformation.

Next, Liz Bagley commented on the Lechmere viaduct replacement bus service.

Next, Lindi-way Riennert from the Boston Transportation Department commented on Fairmount service and the bus network redesign,

Next, Michael Smith commented on the Better Bus Project and Redesign.

Next, Mela Miles from ACE and the T Riders Union commented on the Safety Panel Review report and the Indigo Line AFC fare mitigation.

Next, Evan Foss commented on the role of the Safety Review Panel, maintenance problems and electrification of the system.

Next, Louisa Gag from Livable Streets commented on AFC 2.0 and bus procurement.

Next, Nicola Purvis from FITC/Greater Four Corners Action commented on AFC 2.0 mitigation on the Fairmount Line.

Next, Ari Ofsefit from ITDP commented on the bus network redesign and bus procurement.

Next, Marilyn McNabb commented on The Ride software and issues with google maps and signage.

The last speaker, Patrick Collin from Local 600 commented on the Safety Panel Review report.

Next, was the approval of the minutes of November 4, 2019.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED: to approve the minutes of November 4, 2019**

The approval of the minutes of November 18, 2109 were deferred to a future meeting.

Chair Aiello called upon Hope Patterson, Deputy Director of Stakeholder Engagement to present Agenda Item E, the FMCB Public Schedule. Ms. Patterson reviewed upcoming agenda items with the Board, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "FMCB Public Schedule, December 9, 2019."

Next, Chair Aiello called on Chief Transformation Officer Ron Renaud and Assistant General Manager for Policy Laurel Paget-Seekins to present Agenda F, an update on fare transformation. Ms. Paget-Seekins first provided an update on plans to proceed with the AFC 2.0 project and other improvements to fare collection at the MBTA. Ms. Paget-Seekins reviewed the goals for improving collection and the resetting of the project plan, reconsidering the approach based on customer feedback on sales locations and complaints about the existing system on all modes.

Mr. Renaud continued discussing challenges of the reset and reconsidering the approach from lessons learned from the legacy system and introduced Matt Cole, President of Cubic Transportation and Matthias Augustyniak, Managing Director of Scheidt & Bachmann GmbH (S&B).

Ms. Paget Seekins continued discussing the fare transformation roadmap, and discussion ensued on Charlie Card distribution issues and availability.

Mr. Renaud next discussed a phased rollout approach that included both Cubic and S&B. Mr. Renaud asked Matt Cole, Cubic Transportation President to discuss specific validator issues and technical changes.

Mr. Renaud noted that the reset would result in additional costs incorporating MBTA internal costs, S&B investments in the legacy system and Systems Integrator/Cubic, with an improved and modified contract.

Mr. Renaud said the transformation team was requesting approval of an agreement with S&B of \$49M and approval of an agreement with Systems Integrator/Cubic for \$30M. Mr. Renaud concluded with specific costs and milestones of contracts, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Fare Transformation Update, December 9, 2019." Lengthy discussion ensued on execution strategy. Chair Aiello noted there was a level of complexity moving forward and requested Mr. Renaud return in late January with details of the staffing of the Transformation Team that will manage the project to satisfy the Board to advance any further actions.

On motion, duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**That the General Manager, or his designee, is hereby authorized to award and execute in the name of and on behalf of the Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (the "MBTA"), and in a form approved by General Counsel, an agreement with Scheidt & Bachmann GmbH ("S&B") for certain improvements to MBTA's fare collection system,**



**including improvements to equipment, services, and software, in an not-to-exceed amount of \$49,000,000; and, further, to enter into an ancillary agreement to direct S&B to secure resources and to order long-lead components while the agreement is being negotiated, within the foregoing not-to-exceed amount.**

Next, on motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**That the General Manager, or his designee, is hereby authorized to award and execute in the name of and on behalf of the Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (“MBTA”), and in a form approved by General Counsel, an agreement with Cubic Transportation Systems, Inc. and Boston AFC 2.0 OpCo, LLC in an amount not to exceed \$30,000,000 to mobilize future fare equipment installation design work, software design and development work, design work and software licensing related to interoperability with existing MBTA fare media, design work on validators for future commuter rail gates, and for other related fare collection system activities.**

Next, Chair Aiello called on Ms. Paget-Seekins to present Agenda Item G, the Service Pilot Process Update. Ms. Paget-Seekins reviewed the process timeline, service pilot proposals and its parameters.

Ms. Paget Seekins continued discussing details of pilot proposals on ferry, commuter rail, bus and a weekend and evening bus service proposal.

Ms. Paget-Seekins concluded with a discussion of the Fairmount Line proposal, platform validators for Charlie Card usage, data collection and marketing

and next steps in 2020, as set forth in the attached document labeled, “Service Pilot Process Update, December 9, 2019.” Discussion ensued.

Next, Vice Chair Tibbits-Nutt called on Kat Benesh, Chief of Operations Strategy, Policy & Oversight to present Agenda Item H, an update on the Better Bus Project (BBP) and the on time performance plan. Ms. Benesh provided the Board with a review of the overall status of the Better Bus Project. Ms. Benesh continued with a review of the impact of the Fall BBP near-term changes and planned winter changes, and evaluation criteria for BBP near-term changes, the Fall BBP initial outcomes and plan for Winter BBP changes.

Ms. Benesh concluded noting that bus reliability had improved system-wide 1-2% year over year, discussed bus reliability, building more bus lanes and next steps in 2020, as set forth in the attached document labeled, “On Time Performance & Better Bus Project Update, December 9, 2019.” An in-depth discussion ensued on bus lanes and the unacceptable on time performance.

Next, Chair Aiello called on Caroline Vanesse, Transportation Program Planner to present Agenda Item I, an update on the Bus Network Redesign. Ms. Vanesse reviewed demonstration project design strategies that covered a range of concepts. Ms. Vanesse continued discussing project ideas and selected demonstration projects and applicable data.

Ms. Vanesse reviewed proposals in general and noted over 1,000 ideas were received from the public on project criteria. Ms. Vanesse discussed the summary of demonstration project proposals for three projects: a new route from Mattapan to Longwood Medical Area; Bus Route 112 improvements; and Broadway High Frequency Corridors (104/109; 89/101). Discussion ensued on bus lanes vs. bus lane pilots, the opportunity to create rapid transit-like experience along major corridors; the implementation of peak service in the fall, if not earlier; and project costs.

Ms. Vanesse next discussed the Demonstration Project Partnership with the City of Boston: Center City Link.

Ms. Vanesse concluded with an implementation timeline of the projects discussed above, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Bus Network Redesign Demonstration Projects, December 9, 2019." Discussion ensued.

Next, Chair Aiello called on Ms. Benesh and Director of Vehicle Engineering Bill Wolfgang to present Agenda Item J, the bus procurement. Ms. Benesh, prefaced Mr. Wolfgang, noting that all of the Better Bus Project investments to date have been focused on off-peak service improvements. She said improving peak service was also critical, as the MBTA was not meeting their Service Delivery Policy in many areas. Ms. Benesh noted this was an opportunity for the MBTA to expand the

existing fleet by 60 buses that would allow the MBTA to increase peak bus service by 5%.

Mr. Wolfgang stated that exercising an order through the existing Virginia contract would allow the MBTA to expedite procurement of 60 additional 40-foot buses to support immediate goals to provide enhanced service levels in the Greater Boston area. He said the Authority has successfully procured a substantial number of buses from New Flyer with the identical configuration and the MBTA would benefit from vehicle standardization, inventory simplicity and commonality with existing MBTA fleets.

Mr. Wolfgang concluded that executing an order for identical buses already designed and approved allowed the MBTA to forego a costly and time-consuming design review process, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Hybrid 40-foot Bus Procurement, December 9, 2019." Discussion ensued.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**That the General Manager, or his designee, is hereby authorized to award and execute in the name of and on behalf of the Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (the "MBTA"), and in a form approved by the General Counsel, an order to New Flyer Industries through existing Virginia Contract E194-75548-MA2275 to manufacture, furnish, and deliver sixty (60) new low-floor advanced hybrid buses with spares, training, training aids, special tools, publications, and communications for a total delivered amount not to exceed \$50,207,297.00.**

Next, Chair Aiello called upon Senior Project Director Karl Eckstrom to present Agenda Item K, the Lechmere Viaduct Project. Mr. Eckstrom gave a brief justification and background of the request to the Board that would provide for strengthening the historic 12-span concrete arch viaduct structure and updating the signals and power transmission systems. Mr. Eckstrom noted the 110 year-old structure would utilize the existing 11-month closure window associated with Green Line Extension construction, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Repair/Rehabilitation of East Cambridge (Lechmere) Viaducts, December 9, 2019." Discussion ensued.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**That the General Manager, or his designee, is hereby authorized to award and execute in the name of and on behalf of the Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (the "MBTA"), and in a form approved by the General Counsel, MBTA Construction Contract No. B22CN02: Repair/Rehabilitation of East Cambridge (Lechmere) Viaduct with SPS New England, Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$61,894,820.00**

Lastly, Chair Aiello called upon Joe Cheever, Senior Director of Engineering and Maintenance to present Agenda Item L, the Station Cleaning Contract. Mr. Cheever noted the Board had requested a follow-up from the November 18, 2019 meeting to address concerns they had. Mr. Cheever discussed the MBTA Quality Assurance and Quality Control (QA/QC) defining standards, self-reporting

performance and continuous measurement at 100% of MBTA locations on a quarterly basis.

Mr. Cheever next reviewed a comparison of the MBTA to Massport on performance-based contract by number of customer facing locations, the number of internal staff ensuring cleanliness quality and third party auditors.

Mr. Cheever concluded noting that each vendor had aggressive safety, training, good transportation, supply and equipment plans, as set forth in the attached presentation labeled, "Station Cleaning Contract, December 9, 2019." Discussion ensued.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**That the General Manager, or his designee, is hereby authorized to award and execute in the name of and on behalf of the Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority (the "MBTA"), and in a form approved by the General Counsel, two five-year Facilities and Station Cleaning Contracts with ABM Janitorial Services and Total Maintenance Management Inc. to supply janitorial services with two one-year options, subject to pricing in effect at the time of delivery, for an amount not to exceed \$92,700,000.00.**

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

VOTED: to adjourn at 5:03 p.m.

**Documents relied upon for this meeting:**

Minutes of November 4, 2019

Safety Review Panel – Overview of Final Report, December 9, 2019

Safety Review Panel Final Report, December 9, 2019

FMCB Public Schedule, December 9, 2019

Fare Transformation Update, December 9, 2019.”

Service Pilot Process Update, December 9, 2019

On Time Performance & Better Bus Project Update, December 9, 2019

Bus Network Redesign Demonstration Projects, December 9, 2019

Hybrid 40-foot Bus Procurement, December 9, 2019

Repair/Rehabilitation of East Cambridge (Lechmere) Viaducts, December 9, 2019

Station Cleaning Contract, December 9, 2019